IMSISS Dissertation Feedback & Mark Sheet

Student Matriculation No.	**Glasgow** 2338285 **DCU** 17116431 **Charles** 63432624
Dissertation Title	The Effects of NATO Integration Process on the Military Professionalism of the Georgian Defence Forces

INDIVIDUAL INSTITUTION GRADING

Reviewer 1 Initial Grade *For internal use only*	*Reviewer 2 Initial Grade* *For internal use only*	*Late Submission Penalty* *no penalty*
Word Count Penalty (1 UofG grade point per 500 words below/above the min/max word limit +/- 10%) *Word Count:* 21387 *Suggested Penalty:* no penalty		

JOINT GRADING (subject to agreement of the external examiner and approval at Joint Exam Board)

Final Agreed Mark. (Following correspondence reviewers should list the agreed final internal grade taking before and after any penalties to be applied). *Before Penalty:* A5 [18]   *After Penalty:* A5 [18]

DISSERTATION FEEDBACK

Assessment Criteria	Rating
A. Structure and Development of Answer This refers to your organisational skills and ability to construct an argument in a coherent and original manner	
• *Originality of topic*	Very Good
• *Coherent set of research questions and/or hypothesis identified*	Very Good
• *Appropriate methodology and evidence of effective organisation of work*	Very Good
• *Logically structured argument and flow of ideas reflecting research questions*	Excellent
• *Application of theory and/or concepts*	Very Good
B. Use of Source Material This refers to your skills to select and use relevant information and data in a correct manner	
• *Evidence of reading and review of published literature*	Very Good
• *Selection of relevant primary and/or secondary evidence to support argument*	Excellent
• *Critical analysis and evaluation of evidence*	Good
• *Accuracy of factual data*	Excellent
C. Academic Style This refers to your ability to write in a formal academic manner	
• *Appropriate formal and clear writing style*	Excellent
• *Accurate spelling, grammar and punctuation*	Excellent
• *Consistent and accurate referencing (including complete bibliography)*	Very Good
• *Is the dissertation free from plagiarism?*	Yes
• *Evidence of ethics approval included (if required based on methodology)*	Yes

IMSISS Dissertation Feedback & Mark Sheet

• *Appropriate word count*	Yes

ADDITIONAL WRITTEN COMMENTS

Reviewer 1

This study examines the impact of the NATO integration process on professionalisation of the Georgian Military Forces. Overall, the paper has a clear focus, addresses a topic with both theoretical and practical relevance, is (generally) well written, displays a clear structure, and engages with a broad range of arguments. The thesis provides a clear definition for the main concept (professionalisation) which is operationalised along three dimensions: expertise, responsibility, and corporatness/esprit de corps. The study offers a detailed synopsis of Georgian strategic thinking. The analysis is based on evidence gleaned from 16 elite interviews, video and content analysis. I particularly liked the chapter on military corporatness (pp. 67-83) which effectively linked the theory with the evidence. That said, there are a few aspects that required further attention. First, the introduction could have stated the key arguments more clearly. Second, the study required a stronger rationale for the case selection: why Georgia and not other NATO member aspirant? Does this case illustrate patterns not visible elsewhere? Georgia is not unique in terms of post-Soviet experience and levels of external threat (p. 10). Third, while the material based on elite interviews is impressive, there are no descriptive statistics on either of the three dimensions of professionalisaton (expertise, responsibility, and corporateness). Some descriptive data was necessary on, for example, overall number of soldiers in Georgian army, number of soldiers who benefited from NATO-led training, number of officers receiving training abroad etc. Fourth, the claim (p. 8) that military professionalism is not well understood is unsubstantiated (see the large literature on civil-military relations). Finally, the literature on civil military relations could have been integrated more effectively into the analysis, for example by brief comparisons with professionalisations of the army in the aftermath of regime change across other settings. These comments notwithstanding, the student has produced a very good study.

Reviewer 2

The thesis "The Effects of NATO Integration Process on the Military Professionalism of the Georgian Defence Forces" is an effective piece of research on the Georgian case. It analyzes the case looking to the peculiar Georgian situation near to NATO, EU and to its neighbors such as Russia. The thesis is carefully written from both a linguistic and formal perspective. The evidence considered is definitely able to ground the main conclusions, which are carefully reported in the last part of the thesis, in which limits and possible further research are also considered. The evidence is grounded on a very differentiated variety of valuable sources especially important are the interviews, which are appropriately referenced in the text and that show very insightful aspects of the Georgian situation, which wouldn't be analyzed without them. Indeed, the accuracy of data is sufficient to meet a good level of scientific objectivity and analysis. The variety of the evidence reported, and the interviews considered are definitely one of the best aspects of the thesis. The research question is coherently explained and it is investigated in a consistent way and the reader gets a good picture at the end of the thesis of it. The arguments are presented in a logical way and the reader hardly looses the thread of the argument. In this respect, I would suggest a slightly different structure in order to maximize its consistency. I would have anticipated the methodological part to the chapter two and moved the chapter two. In this way, the reader knows everything he needs to fully follow all the arguments presented without further "jumps". The same argument could be reiterated for the analysis of the responsibility of the military personnel (as far as other general concepts were investigated before). Again, in this way, the reader would have followed all the arguments (very appropriately) presented without recalling what was written in a different place of the thesis. The thesis is very well written from a linguistic perspective, with an accurate spelling in all the text.