

IMSIS Dissertation Feedback & Mark Sheet

Student Matriculation No.	Glasgow 2486413 DCU Charles 59708585 Trento 225063
Dissertation Title	Gender aspects in state-led water security discourses: A case study of the Syr Darya basin countries

INDIVIDUAL INSTITUTION GRADING

Reviewer 1 Initial Grade	Reviewer 2 Initial Grade	Late Submission Penalty No penalty
Word Count Penalty (1-15% over/under = 1gr point; 15-20% over/under = 2 gr points; 20-25% over/under = 3 gr points; more than 25% over/under = 0 fail) Word Count: 20292 Suggested Penalty: no penalty		

JOINT GRADING (subject to agreement of the external examiner and approval at Joint Exam Board)

Final Agreed Mark. (Following correspondence reviewers should list the agreed final internal grade taking before and after any penalties to be applied).
Before Penalty: A2 **After Penalty:** A2

DISSERTATION FEEDBACK

Assessment Criteria	Rating
A. Structure and Development of Answer	
This refers to your organisational skills and ability to construct an argument in a coherent and original manner	
• <i>Originality of topic</i>	Excellent
• <i>Coherent set of research questions and/or hypothesis identified</i>	Excellent
• <i>Appropriate methodology and evidence of effective organisation of work</i>	Excellent
• <i>Logically structured argument and flow of ideas reflecting research questions</i>	Excellent
• <i>Application of theory and/or concepts</i>	Excellent
B. Use of Source Material	
This refers to your skills to select and use relevant information and data in a correct manner	
• <i>Evidence of reading and review of published literature</i>	Excellent
• <i>Selection of relevant primary and/or secondary evidence to support argument</i>	Excellent
• <i>Critical analysis and evaluation of evidence</i>	Excellent
• <i>Accuracy of factual data</i>	Excellent
C. Academic Style	
This refers to your ability to write in a formal academic manner	
• <i>Appropriate formal and clear writing style</i>	Very Good

IMSIS Dissertation Feedback & Mark Sheet

• <i>Accurate spelling, grammar and punctuation</i>	Excellent
• <i>Consistent and accurate referencing (including complete bibliography)</i>	Excellent
• <i>Is the dissertation free from plagiarism?</i>	Yes
• <i>Evidence of ethics approval included (if required based on methodology)</i>	Yes
• <i>Appropriate word count</i>	Yes

ADDITIONAL WRITTEN COMMENTS

Reviewer 1

I have rarely had the chance to read such advanced work at the Masters level. This dissertation is extremely well-researched, clear yet ambitious in its approach, with a thoroughly discussed theoretical approach that is tied in a thoughtful and open way to its methodology, methods and sources. As a result, the discussion of the findings is similarly thoughtful and tied back to theory and method. The findings are genuinely fascinating and convincing, showing the ways that state discourses of water securitization leave multiple silences and remain disconnected from the gendered experiences of water security at the micro level, both the experiences of rural and marginalised women, and those in more apparently powerful positions. What is more, there is a clear and thoughtful discussion about the limitations of the research and how it might be improved that shows a high level of general knowledge and awareness of how social scientific research is done. Many congratulations – and I do hope that this does get taken forward to PhD studies. The quality is certainly equal to it!

Reviewer 2

This was a very accomplished research achievement: well written, beautifully researched, and convincingly structured, this thesis tackled a complex, sophisticated issue in very convincing fashion. The intersection between Central Asia's complex hydro-politics is a truly original angle from which to examine the gendered experience of water securitisation in the Syr Darya basin. What was most impressive, however, was the candidate's maturity in acknowledging the limitation of their research and their awareness in not exaggerating the applicability of their findings. A truly impressive achievement for a masters student!