

UNIVERZITA KARLOVA V PRAZE
Fakulta sociálních věd
Institut mezinárodních studií

PROTOKOL O HODNOCENÍ BAKALÁŘSKÉ PRÁCE
(Posudek oponenta)

Práci předložil(a) student(ka): Denis Pavlíček

Název práce: Ukrajinský nacionalismus v polských tištěných médiích: porovnání vybraných pravicových a liberálně-levicových periodik (2014-2022)

Oponoval (u externích oponentů uveďte též adresu a funkci v rámci instituce): Valeriya Korablyova, Ph.D.

1. OBSAH A CÍL PRÁCE (stručná informace o práci, formulace cíle): Tato bakalářská práce se prostřednictvím vybraných polských tištěných médií (*Rzeczpospolita*, *Gazeta Wyborcza*, *Do Rzeczy* a *Polityka*) zabývá vztahem Poláků k ukrajinskému nacionalismu mezi lety 2014 a 2022. Jejím cílem je identifikovat hlavní rozdíly v přístupu pravicových a liberálně-levicových médií k tématům souvisejícím s ukrajinským nacionalismem ve sledovaném období.

2. VĚCNÉ ZPRACOVÁNÍ (náročnost, tvůrčí přístup, argumentace, logická struktura, teoretické a metodologické ukotvení, práce s prameny a literaturou, vhodnost příloh apod.):

The topic is urgent and well-defined. I liked how the author defined the timeframe and the objects of study. The logic of unfolding the author's argument is justified.

This being said, I have several methodological reservations. First, in the introductory part, the author basically reproduces the dominant Polish discourse on Polish-Ukrainian relations. I would suggest distancing from your object of study by introducing Ukrainian and (more) other non-Polish sources, thus balancing the overly critical approach to Ukraine (as allegedly an underdeveloped country expected to fail) and the overly apologetic approach to the Polish role in these bilateral relations (as allegedly an advanced state, successfully integrated into Euro-Atlantic structures). Also, some theoretical elaborations on the very concept of Ukrainian nationalism are needed: while in the Polish public discourse, it is a moniker for ultra-right radical forces, in Ukraine it is an umbrella term, often equated with patriotism or loyalty to the national project. Secondly, the choice of specific discourse-analysis techniques does not fully uncover the studied problem: the received empirical data leaves too much room for subjective interpretations. I would suggest complementing the used methods, for instance, with semantic network analysis to show how various notions are connected. On top of that, in the undertaken frequency analysis (paragraph 4.3), I'd suggest skipping general and neutral words ("oraz", "nawet", "zostal", "moga", etc.) in favour of including more meaningful notions.

3. FORMÁLNÍ A JAZYKOVÉ ZPRACOVÁNÍ (jazykový projev, správnost citace a odkazů na literaturu, grafická úprava, formální náležitosti práce apod.):

I am not qualified to assess the author's academic language skills in Czech. The sources are quoted correctly. However, in the methodological part, the most reputed authors dealing with discourse-analysis were barely mentioned: instead, the author quotes secondary sources (textbooks) and articles from irrelevant fields (*Journal of advanced nursing*).

I would recommend presenting the results of the undertaken frequency analysis in a more graphical way, for instance, through word clouds.

4. KONTROLA ORIGINALITY TEXTU

Prohlašuji, že jsem se seznámil/a s výsledkem kontroly originality textu závěrečné práce v systému:

Theses Turnitin Ouriginal (Urkund)

Komentář k výsledku kontroly: it is an original research.

5. STRUČNÝ KOMENTÁŘ HODNOTITELE (celkový dojem z bakalářské práce, silné a slabé stránky, originalita myšlenek, naplnění cíle apod.):

It is widely recognised that the mass murder of Poles in Volhynia and Eastern Galicia in 1943-44 by OUN-UPA members belongs to the most discussed historical developments in contemporary Poland. It is a discursively perpetuated collective trauma included in the national canon of historical memory, which casts a long shadow on the bilateral relations with Ukraine. Therefore, the research focus on the public discourse on Ukrainian nationalism in Poland is cutting-edge, whereas the empirical ground being nationwide media is justified, as well as the research angle that compares the right-wing and the centre-left approaches to the topic. At the same time, the centre-left is more variegated than the right-wing in this regard, which requires extra interpretive efforts that account for specific profiles of every centre-left media in question. This creates a certain asymmetry between the two groups of sources.

I would recommend using a broader portfolio of methods for discourse-analysis in order to (1) measure the ration of 'nationalism' texts among all the articles dedicated to Ukraine; (2) reveal clusters of notions associated with Ukrainian nationalism (network analysis); (3) present the results in a more visually persuasive way (word clouds rather than tables). Those recommendations might be taken as guidelines for future research.

The research results are quite insightful and capable of empirically grounding and enriching the debates on the Polish intolerance of Ukrainian nationalism. I find separate cases, uncovered in the process, and the author's attempts to interpret them more interesting than the statistical data: for instance, the article in the right-wing media "Better with Bandera than with Moscow" (footnote 90), or mentioning cooperation between Polish and Ukrainian right-wing radicals (footnote 60).

To conclude, this is good research with interesting results, with a good potential for further development. Some interpretations are debatable and should be better supported with relevant sources but the author provides his personal contribution, and he seems to have a good knowledge of the Polish public sphere. Given the above-mentioned minor drawbacks, I recommend a C grade for the written part of the research.

6. OTÁZKY A PŘIPOMÍNKY DOPORUČENÉ K BLIŽŠÍMU VYSVĚTLENÍ PŘI OBHAJOBĚ (jedna až tři):

1. Why did not you replace the source *Do Rzeczy*, not available for machine-assisted analysis, with another one from the right-wing group?

2. Would it be useful to measure the ratio of publications dedicated to Ukrainian nationalism in all the articles mentioning Ukraine in the analysed sources, as well as to complement the used methods with other ones measuring the connections between the notions (e.g. semantic network analysis)?

3. How would you theoretically disentangle the fear of Ukrainian nationalists from historical resentment? In other words, what are the code words that could embody those political emotions in the public discourse?

7. DOPORUČENÍ / NEDOPORUČENÍ K OBHAJOBĚ A NAVRHOVANÁ ZNÁMKA

(A-F): Doporučuji. The text deserves a C grade.

Datum: 2. 9. 2023

Podpis:



Pozn.: Hodnocení pište k jednotlivým bodům, pokud nepíšete v textovém editoru, použijte při nedostatku místa zadní stranu nebo přiložený list. V hodnocení práce se pokuste oddělit ty její nedostatky, které jsou, podle vašeho mínění, obhajobou neodstranitelné (např. chybí kritické zhodnocení pramenů a literatury), od těch věcí, které student může dobrou obhajobou napravit; poměr těchto dvou položek berte prosím v úvahu při stanovení konečné známky.