

Opposing opinion

Doctoral thesis - "Clinicopathological, morphological, immunohistochemical and molecular biological features of tumours of genitourinary tract"

Author: Joanna Rogala, MD

The submitted dissertation is organized according to accepted rules. In the introduction of the thesis, the recent 5th edition of the WHO classification of kidney tumours from 2022 is commented on 11 pages. Emphasis is placed on the presence of new entities that are defined by a different morphology or molecular-genetic background. There is also a commentary on new findings in previously defined renal neoplasias.

Following the dissertation's objectives are listed, which are:

To describe an unusual and not-so-frequent morphologic pattern of papillary renal cell carcinoma - precisely specified so-called MESTK-like PRCC with its immunohistochemical, molecular features and impact on prognosis.

The second objective was to describe the morphologic spectrum of chromophobe renal cell carcinoma, its immunohistochemical, and molecular features, discuss differential diagnoses, and impact on prognosis.

The last objective was to describe new entities within the recent WHO chapter "other oncocytic tumours".

The next most extensive part of the dissertation presents the results in the form of a total of 7 original articles published in reviewed international journals with an impact factor. In two works, the author of the presented dissertation is listed as the first author, in the remaining five as one of the members of a wider authorial team.

From the point of view of a urologist, the results of the work are interesting, but they do not have a fundamental influence on own clinical/surgical practice in the field of kidney tumours. From the point of view of the histopathological diagnosis of renal lesions and the specification of individual renal lesions, the work is very beneficial.



A summary of the author's publishing and lecturing activities is given at the very end of the dissertation. Both the works that were the basis of the presented dissertation and other works of the author are listed here.

I have no major comments on the submitted dissertation. The topic of the thesis is current and reflects the current trend in the pathological diagnosis of tumours of the genitourinary tract. This is a visible inclination towards molecular genetic examinations and their subsequent implementation in routine diagnostics. This trend is visible in recent years, especially in the field of renal neoplasia diagnostics. The professional level of the work is very good. The actual results of the presented works have been published in renowned international journals with an impact factor.

Conclusion:

The submitted dissertation fulfils all accepted criteria both in terms of content and formality. The author proved that she can formulate and independently solve scientific problems. There is a clear assumption of further independent scientific work.

I evaluate the dissertation positively and recommend it for defence. At the same time, I recommend that the author of the submitted thesis be awarded the title of "Ph.D." after her name after a successful defence of the thesis.

Question: The situation with pink kidney tumors seems to be very complicated, can you do a brief summary for the urologist?

V Plzni 20.6.2023

MUDr. Tomáš Pitra, Ph.D.
Urologická klinika, Fakultní nemocnice
Plzeň
Edvarda Beneše 1128/13
301 00 Plzeň-Bory
