

Review of a Master Thesis

Supervisor

Reviewer

Author of the thesis: Irena Kalfas Benešová	Number of the student: 19220503
Title of the thesis: Foreigners in the Old Kingdom royal reliefs Zobrazení cizinců na královských reliéfech Staré říše	
Number of pages: 126 of pages in total, including: 80 pages of text, 27 pages of bibliography, 19 pages of plates	
The review author: Mgr. Mohamed Megahed, Ph.D.	

Brief evaluation of the thesis:

(The selected subject, the structure of the thesis, the author's argumentation and critical assessment of the subject)

The BA thesis titled "Foreigners in Old Kingdom royal reliefs" presents a comprehensive and detailed analysis of the representation of foreigners in the royal reliefs of Old Kingdom period. The thesis is well organized into several sections that provide a thorough exploration of various aspects related to the depiction of foreigners in the context of the pyramid complexes and rock-carvings at Wadi Maghara.

The introduction in Chapter 1 outlines the significance of ethnic features and defined topics in identifying and categorizing fragments of royal reliefs that depict foreigners during the Old Kingdom. The author explains the purpose of the thesis, which is to categorize these reliefs, analyze their content, and consider their placement within the broader context of royal ideology and artistic development. A wider context of royal relief program development in Chapter 2 is followed by discussion on the individual types of depictions with foreigners in Chapter 3. The final chapter contains the conclusions (Chapter 4).

The study thoroughly addresses the sources of information and the format of the reliefs. Clear explanations are provided for the types of sources studied, primarily focusing on reliefs, and the choice to exclude other formats such as statues and textual records. This choice is rationalized within the context of the research's scope and objectives.

In summary, the BA thesis "Foreigners in Old Kingdom royal reliefs" is a well-researched and comprehensive exploration of a specific aspect of Egyptian art and culture. The study demonstrates a deep understanding of the subject matter and provides a clear and structured presentation of the research findings.

I. Formal criteria

	Excellent	Very Good	Good	Sufficient	Insufficient
Scientific aspect of the thesis					
Unified form of references, bibliography and notes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sufficient referencing to other scholars' works (suitable scientific practice)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Formal aspect of the thesis					
Structure of the thesis	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Clarity of form (Table of contents, division of chapters, etc.)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Captions to figures and tables	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Language					
Clarity and comprehensibility	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Orthography, grammar, diacritics	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Scholarly terminology	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Form and visual aspect					
Layout, font size	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Selection and quality of figures, tables and graphs	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Commentary on the formal aspects of the thesis:

The study's formal elements exemplify the author's commitment to crafting a well-organized academic text. It shows a carefully planned structural framework where chapters follow a logical progression, building upon each other. The incorporation of distinct subheadings within chapters enhances the reader's understanding.

The language employed in this thesis is both precise and suitable, devoid of any superfluous terminology. It effectively conveys intricate concepts, allowing readers from diverse backgrounds understand the content. The author's dedication to maintaining clarity significantly

strengthens the accessibility of her work.

Even though the author is evidently meticulous in citing and referencing sources, some minor errors are noticeable:

- The original sources cited in footnote 172 on page 23 are incorrect, a cross-referencing showed an apparent discrepancy with the information provided; the author should always make sure about her references.
- While preparing this study, it might be advisable for the author to reference the original work of El Awady from 2009, titled “*Abusir XVI. Sahure - The Pyramid Causeway: History and Decoration Program in the Old Kingdom,*” instead of relying on his Ph.D. thesis from 2006.
- There appears to be an omission in footnote 200 on page 26, as the year of publication is not provided.
- It could be beneficial to enhance the text’s credibility by including some more references. For instance, on page 26, after the statement “Moreover, recently new blocks of relief decoration were unearthed in the vicinity of the causeway,” providing a specific reference would strengthen the support for this claim.
- In some instances, general citations are utilized for specific pieces of information, as observed in footnote 209 on page 27.
- The page number is not cited for Diagram 1 on page 39, and the caption of the figures does not include mention of the plate numbers.

II. Subject matter

	Excellent	Very good	Good	Sufficient	Insufficient
Structure of the thesis					
Overview of previous studies on the subject (and theoretical background)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Logical interconnections within the structure	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Clarity of argumentation	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Work with literature					
Selection of scholarly literature on the subject	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Using relevant literature in argumentation	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Critical assessment of the literature	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Methodology					
Formulations of questions and hypotheses	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Selection of sources	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Transparency of the criteria for the selection of sources	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Acknowledgment of the limits of the study of the sources	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Results					
Clarity of the hypotheses	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Reasoning of the hypotheses	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Integration into scholarly studies	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Commentary on the subject matter:

The topic of “Foreigners in Old Kingdom royal reliefs” represents a noteworthy and contemporary investigation into the depictions of foreigners within the royal pyramid complexes of the Old Kingdom and the rock-carvings of Wadi Maghara. This thesis extensively explores the evolution of the decorations portraying foreigners, kings engaged in acts of defeating their enemies, and kings depicted as sphinxes or griffins trampling over their foes. This reflects the

author's dedicated approach to scrutinizing a subject of both contemporary significance and scholarly relevance.

The chosen topic holds undeniable significance within the study of Old Kingdom royal iconography. The author convincingly underscores the value of in-depth exploration in this area. This showcases a profound comprehension of the wider implications of the subject matter and its capacity to enrich the current body of knowledge.

The literature review is thoughtfully organized, offering a thorough survey of scholarly contributions in the field. The author adeptly lays the groundwork for the study by articulating the theoretical framework. Nevertheless, a more rigorous examination of the existing literature, including a critical analysis of its limitations and areas where it falls short, could enhance the thesis's overall strength.

Furthermore, while the author has drawn upon well-known literature related to the subject of foreigners and their depictions, it is advisable for the author to further enhance her understanding by incorporating more comprehensive and detailed studies in the future.

In summary, "Foreigners in Old Kingdom royal reliefs" presents a successful exploration of the portrayal of foreigners in Old Kingdom royal monuments. The thesis underscores the author's dedication to scholarly inquiry, innovative approach, and adept research methodology. As a bachelor's thesis, it lays a promising groundwork for future research in this domain.

The thesis topic shows potential and reflects the author's scholarly competence. It contributes significantly to the field, although there are areas that could benefit from further refinement. Nevertheless, it is clear that the author has embarked on a commendable academic journey, and this thesis represents a significant milestone in her pursuit of knowledge. Therefore, I recommend that the study be accepted for defense before the committee and be rated as "výborně/excellent".

Final result:¹ výborně/excellent (1)

Mgr. Mohamed Megahed, Ph.D

3.9.20223

Date

Signature

¹ Excellent – Very good – Good – Insufficient