

IMSIS Dissertation Feedback & Mark Sheet

Student Matriculation No.	Glasgow 2656577 DCU 307539 Charles 64652184
Dissertation Title	The Growing Demand for 'White Gold' to Accommodate the 'Green' Transition: The Role of Discourse in Shaping the Cooperation Between the European Union and Chile on Lithium

Word Count Penalty (1-15% over/under = 1gr point; 15-20% over/under = 2 gr points; 20-25% over/under = 3 gr points; more than 25% over/under = 0 fail) Word Count: 21.224 Suggested Penalty: no penalty		

JOINT GRADING (subject to agreement of the external examiner and approval at Joint Exam Board)

Final Agreed Mark A1 [22]

DISSERTATION FEEDBACK

Assessment Criteria	Rating
A. Structure and Development of Answer	
This refers to your organisational skills and ability to construct an argument in a coherent and original manner	
• <i>Originality of topic</i>	Excellent
• <i>Coherent set of research questions and/or hypothesis identified</i>	Very Good
• <i>Appropriate methodology and evidence of effective organisation of work</i>	Excellent
• <i>Logically structured argument and flow of ideas reflecting research questions</i>	Excellent
• <i>Application of theory and/or concepts</i>	Excellent
B. Use of Source Material	
This refers to your skills to select and use relevant information and data in a correct manner	
• <i>Evidence of reading and review of published literature</i>	Excellent
• <i>Selection of relevant primary and/or secondary evidence to support argument</i>	Excellent
• <i>Critical analysis and evaluation of evidence</i>	Excellent
• <i>Accuracy of factual data</i>	Excellent
C. Academic Style	
This refers to your ability to write in a formal academic manner	
• <i>Appropriate formal and clear writing style</i>	Excellent
• <i>Accurate spelling, grammar and punctuation</i>	Excellent
• <i>Consistent and accurate referencing (including complete bibliography)</i>	Excellent
• <i>Is the dissertation free from plagiarism?</i>	Yes
• <i>Evidence of ethics approval included (if required based on methodology)</i>	Not required

IMSISS Dissertation Feedback & Mark Sheet

- *Appropriate word count*

Yes

ADDITIONAL WRITTEN COMMENTS

Reviewer 1

The student was able to select an interesting and urgent security issue, related to energy security and the geopolitics of lithium, which reflects the main themes of the IMSISS program. She demonstrated the capacity to circumscribe the research topic in order to make it feasible in the given amount of time and with the available resources and documents. The student critically examined the role of discourse (as emerging from policy documents) in shaping the geopolitics of lithium. Her dissertation demonstrates her ability to address the chosen topic and to coherently build a research design and conduct analysis. I appreciated the ways in which she has been remodeling her proposal ideas while addressing the problems arising from the search of a good research question. She has been attentive to my suggestions and critiques while always adopting a propositional attitude. I think that the final result of the dissertation shows her capacity to identify an important issue - that of energy security in relation to critical minerals - key geopolitical and geoeconomic actors - the EU and Chile - and an interesting question – regarding the achievement of sustainability standards in lithium mining and the different ways in which sustainability is declined. Her research question aims at understanding how domestic discourses on critical minerals (and on the green transition) shape cooperation in the specific case of lithium.

She independently collected, selected and critically analysed relevant literature and arguments of a range of scholars. While some academic works on extractivism, lithium mining, and sustainability already exists, there is still little academic literature addressing the specific topic of international trade agreements in relation to sustainability in the mining sector, which is reflected in the lack of a proper literature on the topic. As a consequence, the student needed to build a theoretical framework drawing from different bulks of literature and she was very good at finding appropriate literature and theoretical references that helped her build her original theoretical and conceptual framework.

The methodology is appropriate to answer the research questions and she correctly identifies the potential limits of her work and her analysis.

She demonstrated the ability to organise her work independently while always being open for discussion and suggestions, and she carefully respected deadlines. The presentation of results and the discussion show the student's capacity to organise the data collected and the findings in a competent manner that makes her argument fluid and logical. The analysis is guided by theories and coherently framed around the student's theoretical and analytical framework. The result is a thorough discussion, especially relevant given the lack of literature focusing on the EU energy security framework in relation to its agreements on critical minerals' supply.

She was also able to address the issues arising from the strong EU investment on electric energy, such as environmental sustainability of extraction, uneven power relations and potential forms of neocolonialism in relation to dependence relations.

Reviewer 2

Overall, this dissertation is very good and I am very happy with it. You have chosen an important topic that needs much more research on. The structure of the work is very good and all the main ingredients are there. I am happy with the embedding in the literature, the design of the project and the empirical material. Your analysis is very good and improves our knowledge on the area.

I would recommend a bit more work on:

- (1) Introduction and conclusion could be a bit more substantial, outlining more clearly the puzzle of the research, the design, and, eventually, a summary of the findings.
- (2) The paragraphing and signposting could be improved at times.



IMSIS Dissertation Feedback & Mark Sheet

Nonetheless, this is a very good dissertation – I am very happy with it! Many congratulations!