

Advisor's Report on Dissertation Thesis

Institute of Economic Studies, Faculty of Social Sciences, Charles University
Opletalova 26, 110 00 Praha 1, Czech Republic
Phone: +420 222 112 330, Fax: +420 222 112 304

Author:	Ali Elminejad
Advisor:	Prof. PhDr. Tomáš Havránek Ph.D. (IES)
Title of the Thesis:	Essays on the meta-analysis of deep parameters
Type of Defense:	DEFENSE
Date of Pre-Defense	April 17, 2024

Address the following questions in your report, please:

- a) Can you recognize an original contribution of the author? YES
- b) Is the thesis based on relevant references? YES
- c) Is the thesis defensible at your home institution or another respected institution where you gave lectures? YES
- d) Do the results of the thesis allow their publication in a respected economic journal? YES
- e) Are there any additional major comments on what should be improved? NO
- f) What is your overall assessment of the thesis? (a) I recommend the thesis for defense without substantial changes

(Note: The report should be at least 2 pages long.)

Ali has successfully incorporated or responded to all the comments raised by the referee. I believe his thesis is ready to be defended. Below I attach my comments from the previous round.

I have known Ali since 2019, having supervised his work on meta-research in macroeconomics and finance. Together, we published a meta-analysis in the *Review of Economic Dynamics*, one of the top journals in the field of macroeconomics. Ali contributed most of the work and handled the revision process. He has also published two additional solo papers, including one meta-analysis. Currently, we have another joint meta-analysis under review (for 6 months now) at the *Journal of Money, Credit and Banking*, where Ali once again contributed the majority of the work. Thus, Ali is an experienced researcher capable of working both independently and as part of a team.

Ali has impressive international experience, having earned an MSc from Bologna and undertaken long-term research stays in Singapore, Heidelberg, Santiago de Chile, and Irvine.

In addition to serving as a TA for my courses, Ali independently managed an entire course on Macroeconomics. He is reliable, innovative, technically skilled, and an excellent writer. Ali's job market paper (though not fully finished and ready for submission to a major journal at this point) is particularly impressive; Ali is the first to attempt a comparison of the extent of publication and attenuation biases in economics. I believe this work has the potential to be published in *Nature Human Behaviour* or a top journal in economics.

It has been my pleasure to supervise Ali Elminejad's work, also (but not only) considering his success on the labor market. The academic labor market, which is extremely competitive in economics, should be viewed as the ultimate test of the quality of Ali's research and overall performance. Top institutions, including Stanford's METRICS, were interested in Ali. Ali has passed this difficult test, and I am happy to recommend his dissertation for defense without any changes (well, perhaps with the exception of an Introduction, which I think should be added to provide some context to the research included in the thesis). I am happy that the Institute of Economic Studies is able to produce PhD students who are successful internationally and can compete for well-paid and highly respected academic positions outside of the Czech Republic.

The dissertation consists of three papers. Two of them are joint projects with me (mentioned above, one on the intertemporal elasticity of labor supply published in the *Review of Economic Dynamics*, the other on the coefficient of relative risk aversion under review at the *Journal of Money, Credit and Banking*), and consequently I have no objections to the way these papers are conducted. The solo-authored meta-analysis is solid and has already been published. Moreover, Ali has at least three papers, at different stages of the publication process, that are not included in the dissertation: one published empirical paper (not a meta-analysis), the job market paper mentioned above, and an applied meta-analysis on the New Keynesian Phillips curve. Therefore it is apparent that Ali is able to produce both quality and quantity.

In his pre-defense lecture, Ali could spend some time describing the current boundaries of meta-research and recent advances in meta-analysis methods (especially regarding p-hacking). But that's up to him, and I conclude by congratulating him on an excellent thesis.

Date:	April 30, 2024
Advisor's Signature	Digitally signed, Tomas Havranek
Advisor's Affiliation	Prof. PhDr. Tomáš Havránek Ph.D. (IES)