



Diploma Thesis Evaluation Form

Author: Juliette Anne Gisèle Begouen Demeaux

Title: **Constructing Carthage as a Threat: A Securitization: Approach to the Causes of the Third Punic War**

Programme/year: MISS 2024

Author of Evaluation (second reader): Tomáš Kučera

Criteria	Definition	Maximum	Points
Major Criteria			
	Research question, definition of objectives	10	8
	Theoretical/conceptual framework	30	28
	Methodology, analysis, argument	40	36
<i>Total</i>		80	72
Minor Criteria			
	Sources	10	10
	Style	5	5
	Formal requirements	5	5
<i>Total</i>		20	20
TOTAL		100	92



Evaluation

Major criteria:

This is a thesis on a very interesting and intellectually stimulating topic. It makes a valuable contribution to the historiography of the Third Punic War. By employing the securitization theory on this historical material, the author demonstrates her great competence both in security studies and Roman history.

While the thesis is very competently researched and proficiently written, questions remain about the intended contribution of the thesis. The thesis clearly addresses its second research question: "What means did Cato the Elder employ to portray Carthage as an existential threat...". Although the empirical material is limited, Cato's rhetoric represents an undisputable securitization act and thus inviting securitization analysis. However, the empirical evidence significantly limits the analysis of context and audience.

The first research question – How does the application of securitization theory contribute to our understanding of Cato's discourse and its impact on the outbreak of the war – is addressed rather implicitly. Answer to this question is mostly limited to the literature review, where the thesis research is compared and contrasted with the existing interpretations.

Among the intended contributions is to demonstrate the potential for applying a modern theoretical framework to historical events. The author should be aware and acknowledge that a tradition of using ancient cases in IR and security studies already exist, e.g. Peloponnesian war being used as testbed for neorealist theory (Garst 1989, Copeland 1996) or for democratic peace theory (Russett and Antholis 1992, Weart 1998, 2001). This literature could show a potential utility of historical case studies.

Minor criteria

ok

Assessment of plagiarism:

ok

Overall evaluation:

This is very interesting and readable thesis that demonstrates author's proficiency and knowledge.

Suggested grade: A

Signature:



**FACULTY
OF SOCIAL SCIENCES**
Charles University