



Diploma Thesis Evaluation Form

Author: Matteo del Vecchio

Title: From the Sublime Porte to Mogadishu: reading neottomanism and its trajectory in the history of republican Turkey

Programme/year: International Security Studies, 2024

Author of Evaluation (second reader): Emil Aslan

Criteria	Definition	Maximum	Points
Major Criteria			
	Research question, definition of objectives	10	8
	Theoretical/conceptual framework	30	27
	Methodology, analysis, argument	40	37
<i>Total</i>		80	72
Minor Criteria			
	Sources	10	8
	Style	5	5
	Formal requirements	5	3
<i>Total</i>		20	16
TOTAL		100	88



Evaluation

Major criteria: This thesis is interesting in that it links the phenomenon of neo-ottomanism to critical theories. While this certainly is an interesting intellectual endeavor, to the best of my knowledge, such attempts have been made in the recent past. I would thus appreciate a clearer state of the author to the previous research to make sure the author's intellectual contribution is as flashed out and explicit as possible. The author mainly engages with Gramsci (theory of cultural hegemony) and Holsti (role theory) to make sense of neo-ottomanism as a distinct foreign policy practice, and to rid it of prevailing orientalist attitudes. While I appreciate the author's intellectual journey, I have a feeling that this is too extensive for the purpose of a MA thesis as it makes the argument somewhat superfluous at times. An engagement with original Turkish-languages sources, missing in the thesis, would somewhat tilt the data selection, with the potential of altering the final findings. All this notwithstanding, I consider this thesis a bold and confident piece of research on a phenomenon that deserves attention.

Minor criteria: While the analysis is interesting and sound, the text makes an impression of an unfinished draft that needs a couple of days of polishing. The structure of the thesis is fine and the author utilizes seminal works in the field.

Assessment of plagiarism: None detected.

Overall evaluation: A very good piece of research on an important topic.

Suggested grade: B

Signature: Emil Aslan