



## Diploma Thesis Evaluation Form

Author: Matteo Del Vecchio

Title: From the Sublime Porte to Mogadishu: reading neottomanism and its trajectory in the history of republican Turkey

Programme/year: International security studies/2024

Author of Evaluation (supervisor): Aliaksei Kazharski

Criteria	Definition	Maximum	Points
<b>Major Criteria</b>			
	Research question, definition of objectives	<b>10</b>	2
	Theoretical/conceptual framework	<b>30</b>	30
	Methodology, analysis, argument	<b>40</b>	21
<i>Total</i>		<b>80</b>	53
<b>Minor Criteria</b>			
	Sources	<b>10</b>	9
	Style	<b>5</b>	4
	Formal requirements	<b>5</b>	5
<i>Total</i>		<b>20</b>	17
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>100</b>	70



## Evaluation

**Major criteria:**

**Minor criteria:**

**Assessment of plagiarism:** I could see no indications of plagiarism in the thesis.

### Overall evaluation:

The thesis is an interesting attempt to conceptualize Turkey's foreign and domestic policies using three different theoretical frameworks, namely Gramsci's theory of hegemony, role theory and the ontological security theory. The thesis is fairly well-written from the stylistic point of view, although some parts feel too old-fashioned and out of tune with the conventional style of contemporary academic writing. Also, the text is in dire need of proofreading with multiple typos to be found across the text and even (!) in the title of the thesis itself as stated on the front page.

While the choice of theoretical frameworks and the overall arguments make sense, the main problem of the thesis lies in its vague research design. The research question should have been reformulated to point out a specific research problem. In its present form it is introduced on p.12 as "how can social sciences help to read the phenomenon of neo-ottomanism". However, it is unclear what it is that we need "help" with in the first place – and why? What is the actual question that needs to be answered? Consequently, the rationale for theory selection also remains unclear. Why do we need three theories – and not two or five? The general rule is theoretical parsimony, but the choice of theory (or theories) is ultimately guided by the research problem, which is not stated. Finally, the thesis is written based purely on secondary sources, which is not always necessarily a problem, but this aspect must be reflected in the research design description.

Sadly, as the thesis supervisor I could not ameliorate these shortcomings as the final draft of the thesis was submitted without me having had a chance to take a look at it.

**Suggested grade:**

("D" 70)

**Signature:**



**FACULTY  
OF SOCIAL SCIENCES**  
Charles University