



## Diploma Thesis Evaluation Form

Author: Manvi Krishnamurthy

Title: Tracing the Mumbai Underworld and Its Terrorism Nexus and What It Means for the 21st Century Indian Security

Programme/year: International Security Studies, 2024

Author of Evaluation (second reader): Tomáš Karásek

Criteria	Definition	Maximum	Points
<b>Major Criteria</b>			
	Research question, definition of objectives	<b>10</b>	5
	Theoretical / conceptual framework	<b>30</b>	12
	Methodology, analysis, argument	<b>40</b>	25
<i>Total</i>		<b>80</b>	<b>42</b>
<b>Minor Criteria</b>			
	Sources	<b>10</b>	6
	Style	<b>5</b>	2
	Formal requirements	<b>5</b>	1
<i>Total</i>		<b>20</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>100</b>	<b>51</b>



## Evaluation

### Major criteria:

It is painful to review a thesis into which the author obviously invested an enormous amount of energy – but which, unfortunately, at the end just barely holds up as an academic text. The topic that promises an analysis of the intersection of organized crime and terrorism, is certainly valid, but the way it was handled unfortunately undermines the initial intention.

To start with, the research question, formulated in the introduction, is rather a journalistic than an academic one. And, in fact, the resulting text, if overworked and properly polished, could easily serve as a fine piece of journalistic investigation. However, an academic text requires a clear conceptual or theoretical anchoring, ideally explained at the beginning thereof – not a feature of the thesis under review. The overview of various approaches to organized crime in chapter 3 can be understood as an attempt at theorization, but it is not subsequently translated into any meaningful methodological form.

The author also profoundly misunderstood the purpose of literature review which should serve as an introduction into the academic sources covering and surrounding the selected research topic – ideally paving the way towards the conceptual anchoring thereof. Here the chapter is used as a narrative exposé of Mumbai mafia networks.

The insight into the world of organized crime in India and its intersection with other spheres (politics, intelligence operations, pop-culture) is fascinating, and, once again, the author must be lauded for her effort. Due to the failings listed above (as well as the formal deficiencies mentioned below), it is more the effort itself than its result that pushed the thesis above the line of defensibility.

### Minor criteria:

The thesis is hindered by several formal problems: The paragraphs are overlong, often over two pages. The alignment of the text changes throughout, and there is a wild inconsistency in the use of different sizes of the font, highlighting, italics etc. The pages are not numbered (sic!).



**FACULTY  
OF SOCIAL SCIENCES**  
Charles University

**Assessment of plagiarism:**

The thesis does not exhibit explicit traits of plagiarism, but there are several disconcerting elements. To start with, there is not a single reference to a source in the thesis's preface. The author also selected a hugely simplified system of references that does not use the year of publication, and a worrying proportion of the references does not contain the number of a specific page.

**Overall evaluation:**

A possibly fascinating topic has, unfortunately, been weighed down with many problems concerning conceptualization, methodology, structuring as well as formal aspect of the thesis. As a result, it can be just barely considered a defensible graduate text.

**Suggested grade: E**

**Signature:**