IMESS dissertation							
Name/code:	Liubov Borisova						
Dissertation title:	Health Systems in Transition						
Scale: 5 - excellent, 4 - good, 3 - satisfactory, 2 - poor, 1 – very poor							
	5	**4**	**3**	**2**	**1**		
ARGUMENT:							
Clearly defined research question	X					No clearly defined research question	
Answers research question	X					Does not answer research question	
Well structured	X					Badly structured	
Shows theoretical awareness	X					Shows no theoretical awareness	
Conceptual clarity		X				Conceptual confusion	
Empirically appropriate & robust		X				Full of empirical errors	
Logical and coherent	X					Illogical and incoherent	
Analytical	X					Descriptive	
Critical	X					Uncritical	
Shows independent thought	X					Does not show independent thought	
SOURCES & USAGE:							
Evidence of reading/research	X					No evidence of reading/research	
Effective use of sources/data	X					Ineffective use of sources/data	
WRITING STYLE:							
Clear		X				Obscure	
Good punctuation		X				Poor punctuation	
Grammatically correct		X				Grammatically incorrect	
PRESENTATION:							
Appropriate length						Too long/short	
Good referencing	X					Poor/inconsistent referencing	
Good spelling		X				Poor spelling	
Good bibliography	X					Poor bibliography	

Comments: This is a very well-written, comprehensive, well-researched and informative piece of research. The analysis is thorough and systematic and is a long way beyond the level expected of the typical Masters student at UCL. It forms a substantial launch pad for a PhD. At times the results are too detailed in presentation and this makes it difficult to follow and in parts the language is not 'academic' in style though in other parts it is. It is a really promising piece of work. Particularly impressive is the attempt, not always absolutely convincing, to use cluster analysis in the subsequent regression models. In sum the thesis marks a contribution.

Specific Questions for oral defence:

What are the limitations of your models when it comes to capturing the dynamic relationships in estimating a health production function? e.g. would you expect a long-lasting effect of macroeconomic shocks on your dependent variables or simply one-off, instant shocks?

What is the mechanism through which inflation appears to impact upon health outcomes?

What are the downsides of including these macro level variables in the health production function?

How would you envisage building on this approach in future research?

What are the practical policy implications arising from your research for the countries of transition?

What do you see as your major contribution to the literature?

Deducted for late submission: 0	Deducted for faulty referencing: 0	**% Mark***: 78	
ECTS Mark: A	Signed: Dr Nivorozhkin	Date:	03/06/09

*Mark: A = 70+; B = 65-69; C = 60-64; D = 55-59; E = 50-54; F = fail, less than 50.